

Håkon Finne

Governance of Major Public ICT Projects. Managers' Experiences and Opinions

Concept report no. 56

concept



Håkon Finne

Governance of Major Public ICT Projects. Managers' Experiences and Opinions

Concept report no. 56

Concept report no. 56

Governance of Major Public ICT Projects. Managers' Experiences and Opinions

English summary

Original title: Styring og gjennomføring av store statlige IKT-prosjekter.
Eksperters erfaringer og vurderinger

Håkon Finne
SINTEF Digital

ISSN: 0803-9763 (paper version)
ISSN: 0804-5588 (web version)
ISBN: 978-82-93253-75-4 (paper version)
ISBN: 978-82-93253-76-1 (web version)

© The Concept Research Programme. The publication may be quoted freely with attribution.

DATE: June 2019

PUBLISHER
Ex ante academic publisher

Concept Research Programme
Norwegian University of Science and Technology
7491 NTNU – Trondheim
Norway
www.ntnu.no/concept

The responsibility for the information in the reports produced on behalf of the Concept Research Programme is on the commissioned party. Views and conclusions is on account of the authors and not necessarily identical to the views of the Concept Research Programme. All contributions are reviewed in a peer review process.

English summary

The present report describes experiences from design, governance, and implementation of large ICT projects in national government agencies in Norway. The experiences are gained by individuals who have played key roles (or still do) as project managers or representatives of project owners in many such projects over a number of years. These experiences have been collected and processed through facilitated workshops, where a total of 25 experts have shared their experiences. In this report they are integrated in an analytical framework and connected to policy questions for further handling of this kind of projects.

The background is the tendency that large ICT projects have for large cost or time overruns, or for being terminated after large expenditures without useable solutions for the project owner. Out of 20 ICT or telecom projects that until now have been submitted to the quality assurance procedures of the Norwegian state project model, at least one in four have had significant challenges or either been terminated after high expenditures or been put on hold. The Ministry of Finance's quality assurance scheme does not seem sufficient to handle these issues. Some studies suggest that the distribution of cost overruns is far from gaussian, that there is a considerable share of very high overruns (Budzier og Flyvbjerg, 2011). This gives a rationale to search for important causes and to seek remedies against them.

The discussion of a long series of topics related to project size, duration, and complexity shows that complexity in itself increases the risk of considerable overruns. The drivers of complexity make up a mixture of a considerable ICT investment lag (there is a lot to catch up with) and tendencies to add on more tasks once a project stands a chance to receive funding. Increased complexity and duration on their side make it harder to succeed with a classical waterfall implementation strategy. There will always be a need for changes during the project, and the lack in flexibility may cause large ripple effects for every change made. How to handle obsolete technologies selected long before project implementation is one of these problems. A segmentation of projects to make each of them more homogeneous may be a useful strategy.

Discussions also showed the digital maturity of agencies to vary considerably, and that this has major implications for design, governance, continuous follow-up, implementation, and benefits realization – and hence also for cost, time for completion, benefit, quality, and profitability. Good project managers may compensate for some of this, particularly if they have a good rapport with a strong project champion in top management. They may also drive a more rapid process of maturation in the agency if the project is organized with many and well-organized contact points towards the user organization and the latter is willing to invest sufficient time and resources for this purpose. This obviously has a cost, as do the changes required to benefit fully from the ICT solutions in the operations of the agency.

What good project managers can contribute, which is what makes them attractive, is to a great extent about how they handle the project organization internally and how they regulate the relationship with the owner and user organization(s). Virtually all conceivable contingencies will occur in a project of long duration; hence project management is first and foremost risk management, and in this case, it is imperative that the 'software factory' is more or less self-managed. This can be achieved through a high degree of autonomy in how the teams solve the tasks they are allocated. It also depends on personnel turnover not to become too high, since good solutions are dependent on specific knowledge about the agency, its work, and choices done throughout the project – context-specific and experience-based, frequently tacit, knowledge. This may necessitate personnel management at the project level, a function that normally is allocated to the basis organizations alone.

The report tentatively concludes that project complexity preferably should be reduced at the design stage. Four main categories of activities are suggested on the basis of the experiences reported: roll-out of standard solutions in large quantities, establishment of central infrastructure services, digitalization (and simplification) of existing work processes, and development of new (or major transformation of old) capabilities. Each of these has its own project logic, and it may be a good idea to keep them separated as much as practically possible in order to reduce cost-driving project design complexity.

Development is rapid in this area. Since the data collection for this report began in 2014, there reportedly has been a significant change in the direction of designing new ICT projects in state agencies with greater homogeneity and lesser scope. The threshold for mandatory quality assurance is now being considerably lowered and applying to the portfolio level.

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
No 1	Styring av prosjektporlefører i staten. Usikkerhetsavsetning på porteføljenivå <i>Project Portfolio Management. Estimating Provisions for Uncertainty at Portfolio Level.</i>	Stein Berntsen and Thorleif Sunde
No 2	Statlig styring av prosjektledelse. Empiri og økonomiske prinsipper. <i>Economic Incentives in Public Project Management</i>	Dag Morten Dalen, Ola Lædre and Christian Riis
No 3	Beslutningsunderlag og beslutninger i store statlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Decisions and the Basis for Decisions in Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Stein V. Larsen, Eilif Holte and Sverre Haanæs
No 4	Konseptutvikling og evaluering i store statlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Concept Development and Evaluation in Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Hege Gry Solheim, Erik Dammen, Håvard O. Skaldebø, Eystein Myking, Elisabeth K. Svendsen and Paul Torgersen
No 5	Bedre behovsanalyser. Erfaringer og anbefalinger om behovsanalyser i store offentlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Needs Analysis in Major Public Investment Projects. Lessons and Recommendations</i>	Petter Næss
No 6	Målformulering i store statlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Alignment of Objectives in Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Ole Jonny Klakegg
No 7	Hvordan tror vi at det blir? Effektvurderinger av store offentlige prosjekter <i>Up-front Conjecture of Anticipated Effects of Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Nils Olsson
No 8	Realopsjoner og fleksibilitet i store offentlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Real Options and Flexibility in Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Kjell Arne Brekke

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
No 9	Bedre utforming av store offentlige investeringsprosjekter. Vurdering av behov, mål og effekt i tidligfasen <i>Improved Design of Public Investment Projects. Up-front Appraisal of Needs, Objectives and Effects</i>	Petter Næss med bidrag fra Kjell Arne Brekke, Nils Olsson and Ole Jonny Klakegg
No 10	Usikkerhetsanalyse – Kontekst og grunnlag <i>Uncertainty Analysis – Context and Foundations</i>	Kjell Austeng, Olav Torp, Jon Terje Midtbø, Ingemund Jordanger, and Ole M Magnussen
No 11	Usikkerhetsanalyse – Modellering, estimering og beregning <i>Uncertainty Analysis – Modeling, Estimation and Calculation</i>	Frode Drevland, Kjell Austeng and Olav Torp
No 12	Metoder for usikkerhetsanalyse <i>Uncertainty Analysis – Methodology</i>	Kjell Austeng, Jon Terje Midtbø, Vidar Helland, Olav Torp and Ingemund Jordanger
No 13	Usikkerhetsanalyse – Feilkilder i metode og beregning <i>Uncertainty Analysis – Methodological Errors in Data and Analysis</i>	Kjell Austeng, Vibeke Binz and Frode Drevland
No 14	Positiv usikkerhet og økt verdiskaping <i>Positive Uncertainty and Increasing Return on Investments</i>	Ingemund Jordanger
No 15	Kostnadsusikkerhet i store statlige investeringsprosjekter; Empiriske studier basert på KS2 <i>Cost Uncertainty in Large Public Investment Projects. Empirical Studies</i>	Olav Torp (red.), Ole M Magnussen, Nils Olsson and Ole Jonny Klakegg
No 16	Kontrahering i prosjektets tidligfase. Forsvarets anskaffelser. <i>Procurement in a Project's Early Phases. Defense Aquisitions</i>	Erik N. Warberg
No 17	Beslutninger på svakt informasjonsgrunnlag. Tilnærmingar og utfordringer i prosjekters tidlige fase	Kjell Sunnevåg (red.)

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
	<i>Decisions Based on Scant Information. Challenges and Tools During the Front-end Phases of Projects</i>	
No 18	Flermålsanalyser i store statlige investeringsprosjekt <i>Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis In Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Ingemund Jordanger, Stein Malerud, Harald Minken and Arvid Strand
No 19	Effektvurdering av store statlige investeringsprosjekter <i>Impact Assessment of Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Bjørn Andersen, Svein Bråthen, Tom Fagerhaug, Ola Nafstad, Petter Næss and Nils Olsson
No 20	Investorers vurdering av prosjekters godhet <i>Investors' Appraisal of Project Feasibility</i>	Nils Olsson, Stein Frydenberg, Erik W. Jakobsen, Svein Arne Jessen, Roger Sørheim og Lillian Waagø
No 21	Logisk minimalisme, rasjonalitet - og de avgjørende valg <i>Major Projects: Logical Minimalism, Rationality and Grand Choices</i>	Knut Samset, Arvid Strand and Vincent F. Hendricks
No 22	Miljøkonomi og samfunnsøkonomisk lønnsomhet <i>Environmental Economics and Economic Viability</i>	Kåre P. Hagen
No 23	The Norwegian Front-End Governance Regime of Major Public Projects – A Theoretically Based Analysis and Evaluation	Tom Christensen
No 24	Markedsorienterte styringsmetoder i miljøpolitikken <i>Market oriented approaches to environmental policy</i>	Kåre P. Hagen
No 25	Regime for planlegging og beslutning i sykehusprosjekter	Asmund Myrbostad, Tarald Rohde, Pål Martinussen and Marte Lauvsnes

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
	<i>Planning and Decision Making in Hospital Projects. Lessons with the Norwegian Governance Scheme.</i>	
No 26	Politisk styring, lokal rasjonalitet og komplekse koalisjoner. Tidligfaseprosessen i store offentlige investeringsprosjekter <i>Political Control, Local Rationality and Complex Coalitions. Focus on the Front-End of Large Public Investment Projects</i>	Erik Whist and Tom Christensen
No 27	Verdsetting av fremtiden. Tidshorisont og diskonteringsrenter <i>Valuing the future. Time Horizon and Discount Rates</i>	Kåre P. Hagen
No 28	Fjorden, byen og operaen. En evaluering av Bjørvikautbyggingen i et beslutningsteoretisk perspektiv <i>The Fjord, the City and the Opera. An Evaluation of Bjørvika Urban Development</i>	Erik Whist and Tom Christensen
No 29	Levedyktighet og investeringstiltak. Erfaringer fra kvalitetssikring av statlige investeringsprosjekter <i>Sustainability and Public Investments. Lessons from Major Public Investment Projects</i>	Ola Lædre, Gro Holst Volden and Tore Haavaldsen
No 30	Etterevaluering av statlige investeringsprosjekter. Konklusjoner, erfaringer og råd basert på pilotevaluering av fire prosjekter <i>Evaluating Public Investment Projects. Lessons and Advice from a Meta-Evaluation of Four Projects</i>	Gro Holst Volden and Knut Samset
No 31	Store statlige investeringers betydning for konkurranse- og markedsutviklingen. Håndtering av konkurransemessige problemstillinger i utredningsfasen	Asbjørn Englund, Harald Bergh, Aleksander Møll and Ove Skaug Halsos

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
	<i>Major Public Investments' Impact on Competition. How to Deal with Competition Issues as Part of the Project Appraisal</i>	
No 32	Analyse av systematisk usikkerhet i norsk økonomi. <i>Analysis of Systematic Uncertainty in the Norwegian Economy.</i>	Haakon Vennemo, Michael Hoel and Henning Wahlquist
No 33	Planprosesser, beregningsverktøy og bruk av nytte-kostnadsanalyser i vegsektoren. En sammenlikning av praksis i Norge og Sverige. <i>Planning, Analytic Tools and the Use of Cost-Benefit Analysis in the Transport Sector in Norway and Sweden.</i>	Morten Welde, Jonas Eliasson, James Odeck and Maria Börjesson
No 34	Mulighetsrommet. En studie om konseptutredninger og konseptvalg <i>The Opportunity Space. A Study of Conceptual Appraisals and the Choice of Conceptual Solutions.</i>	Knut Samset, Bjørn Andersen and Kjell Austeng
No 35	Statens prosjektmodell. Bedre kostnadsstyring. Erfaringer med de første investeringstiltakene som har vært gjennom ekstern kvalitetssikring	Knut Samset and Gro Holst Volden
No 36	Investing for Impact. Lessons with the Norwegian State Project Model and the First Investment Projects that Have Been Subjected to External Quality Assurance	Knut Samset and Gro Holst Volden
No 37	Bruk av karbonpriser i praktiske samfunnsøkonomiske analyser. En oversikt over praksis fra analyser av statlige investeringsprosjekter under KVU-/KS1-ordningen. <i>Use of Carbon Prices in Cost-Benefit Analysis. Practices in Project Appraisals of Major Public Investment Projects under the Norwegian State Project Model</i>	Gro Holst Volden

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
No 38	Ikke-prissatte virkninger i samfunnsøkonomisk analyse. Praksis og erfaringer i statlige investeringsprosjekter <i>Non-Monetized Impacts in Economic Analysis. Practice and Lessons from Public Investment Projects</i>	Heidi Bull-Berg, Gro Holst Volden and Inger Lise Tyholt Grindvoll
No 39	Lav prising – store valg. En studie av underestimering av kostnader i prosjekters tidligfase <i>Low estimates – high stakes. A study of underestimation of costs in projects' earliest phase</i>	Morten Welde, Knut Samset, Bjørn Andersen and Kjell Austeng
No 40	Mot sin hensikt. Perverse incentiver – om offentlige investerings-prosjekter som ikke forplikter <i>Perverse incentives and counterproductive investments. Public funding without liabilities for the recipients</i>	Knut Samset, Gro Holst Volden, Morten Welde and Heidi Bull-Berg
No 41	Transportmodeller på randen. En utforskning av NTM5-modellens anvendelsesområde <i>Transport models and extreme scenarios. A test of the NTM5 model</i>	Christian Steinsland and Lasse Fridstrøm
No 42	Brukervgifter i veisektoren <i>User fees in the road sector</i>	Kåre Petter Hagen and Karl Rolf Pedersen
No 43	Norsk vegplanlegging: Hvilke hensyn styrer anbefalingene <i>Road Planning in Norway: What governs the selection of projects?</i>	Arvid Strand, Silvia Olsen, Merethe Dotterud Leiren and Askill Harkjerr Halse
No 44	Ressursbruk i transportsektoren – noen mulige forbedringer <i>Resource allocation in the transport sector – some potential improvements</i>	James Odeck (ed.) and Morten Welde (ed.)
No 45	Kommunale investeringsprosjekter. Prosjektmodeller og krav til beslutningsunderlag. <i>Municipal investment practices in Norway</i>	Morten Welde, Jostein Aksdal and Inger Lise Tyholt Grindvoll

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
No 46	Styringsregimer for store offentlige prosjekter. En sammenliknende studie av prinsipper og praksis i seks land. <i>Governance schemes for major public investment projects: A comparative study of principles and practices in six countries</i>	Knut F. Samset, Gro Holst Volden, Nils Olsson and Eirik Vårdal Kvalheim
No 47	Governance Schemes for Major Public Investment Projects. A comparative study of principles and practices in six countries.	Knut F. Samset, Gro Holst Volden, Nils Olsson and Eirik Vårdal Kvalheim
No 48	Investeringsprosjekter og miljøkonsekvenser. En antologi med bidrag fra 16 forskere. <i>Environmental Impact of Large Investment Projects. An Anthology by 16 Norwegian Experts.</i>	Kåre P. Hagen and Gro Holst Volden
No 49	Finansiering av vegprosjekter med bompenger. Behandling av og konsekvenser av bompenger i samfunnsøkonomiske analyser. <i>Financing road projects with tolls. The treatment of and consequences of tolls in cost benefit analyses.</i>	Morten Welde, Svein Bråthen, Jens Rekdal and Wei Zhang
No 50	Prosjektmodeller og prosjekteierstyring i statlige virksomheter. <i>Project governance and the use of project models in public agencies and line ministries in Norway.</i>	Bjørn Andersen, Eirik Vårdal Kvalheim and Gro Holst Volden
No 51	Kostnadskontroll i store statlige investeringer underlagt ordningen med ekstern kvalitetssikring. <i>Cost performance in government investment projects that have been subjected to external quality assurance.</i>	Morten Welde
No 52	Statlige investeringer under lupen. Erfaring med evaluering av de 20 første KS-prosjektene.	Gro Holst Volden and Knut Samset

Concept report series

Paper version: ISSN 0803-9763

Web version: ISSN 0804-5585

Norwegian version: www.ntnu.no/concept/publikasjoner/rapportserie

English version: <https://www.ntnu.no/web/concept/concept-rapportserie>

Report	Title	Author (-s)
	<i>A Close-up on Public Investment Cases. Lessons from Ex-post Evaluations of 20 Major Norwegian Projects</i>	
No 53	Fremsynsmetoder <i>Foresight methods</i>	Tore Sager
No 54	Neglected and underestimated impacts of transport investments	Petter Næss, Gro Holst Volden, James Odeck and Tim Richardson
No 55	Kostnadsstyring i entreprisekontrakter <i>Cost performance in construction contracts</i>	Morten Welde, Roy Endre Dahl, Olav Torp and Torbjørn Aass
No. 56	Styring og gjennomføring av store statlige IKT-prosjekter. Eksperters erfaringer og vurderinger <i>Governance of Major Public ICT Projects. Managers' Experiences and Opinions</i>	Håkon Finne

Concept report no. 56

www.ntnu.no/concept/

Forskningsprogrammet Concept skal utvikle kunnskap som sikrer bedre ressursutnytting og effekt av store, statlige investeringer. Programmet driver følgeforskning knyttet til de største statlige investeringsprosjektene over en rekke år. En skal trekke erfaringer fra disse som kan bedre utformingen og kvalitetssikringen av nye investeringsprosjekter før de settes i gang.

Concept er lokalisert ved Norges teknisk-naturvitenskapelige universitet i Trondheim (NTNU), ved Fakultet for ingeniørvitenskap og teknologi. Programmet samarbeider med ledende norske og internasjonale fagmiljøer og universiteter, og er finansiert av Finansdepartementet.

The Concept research program aims to develop know-how to help make more efficient use of resources and improve the effect of major public investments. The Program is designed to follow up on the largest public projects over a period of several years, and help improve design and quality assurance of future public projects before they are formally approved.

The program is based at The Norwegian University of Science and Technology (NTNU), Faculty of Engineering Science and Technology. It cooperates with key Norwegian and international professional institutions and universities, and is financed by the Norwegian Ministry of Finance.

Address:

The Concept Research Program
Høgskoleringen 7A
N-7491 NTNU
Trondheim
NORWAY

ISSN: 0803-9763 (paper version)
ISSN: 0804-5588 (web version)
ISBN: 978-82-93253-75-4 (paper version)
ISBN: 978-82-93253-76-1 (web version)

