Exercise 1 (40 points)

In their paper "A nation of immigrants: Assimilation and economic outcomes in the age of mass migration" published in the Journal of Political Economy in 2014, Abramitzky, Boustan, and Eriksson study the assimilation of European immigrants in the United States labor market during 1850-1913. In this period almost thirty million, mostly European, immigrants moved to the US. The common view among scholars has been that European immigrants held substantially lower-paid occupations than natives upon first arrival, but that they converged with the native born after spending some time in the US. The paper provides new light to this issue.

The authors construct two datasets. They start by obtaining three random samples of migrants and natives from the United States census of the population, one for year 1900, one for the year 1910 and finally one for the year 1920. For the second dataset, they build a panel dataset in the following way. They start from the random sample of natives and migrants they have for 1900 and then they search these individuals by their name, surname and age in the 1910 Census and, again, in the 1920 Census. In doing this exercise, their matching rate is about 25%. In other words the authors are able to follow 25% of the original 1900 sample over time.

Next, they estimate different versions of the following model:

$$Earnings_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 Y 0_{-5} + \beta_2 Y 6_{-10} + \beta_3 Y 11_{-20} + \beta_4 Y 21_{-30} + \beta_5 Y 30_{it} + \beta_6 age_{it} + \beta_7 age_{it}^2 + \beta_8 age_{it}^3 + \beta_8 age_{it}^4 + \beta_9 after 1890 + \theta_t + \alpha_i + a_i + u_{it}$$
(1)

In equation (1), i indicates individuals and t time (1900, 1910, 1920). Earnings_{it} measures the earnings of individuals in 2010 dollars; $Y0_{-}5$ is an indicator that equals one if the migrant has spent in the US zero to 5 years and zero otherwise, $Y6_{-}10$ is an indicator that equals one if the migrant has spent in the US 6 to 10 years and zero otherwise, and so on, until Y30, which is an indicator that equals one if the migrant has spent in the US more than 30 years and zero otherwise. The omitted category here is being a US born. age_{it} indicates the age of the individual, which appears as a fourth-degree polynomial; after1890 is an indicator that equals one if the migrant arrived after 1890. Finally, θ_t indicates Census year fixed effects, α_j indicates country of birth fixed effects and a_i indicates individual fixed effects.

The results from their analysis are reported in Table 1 on page 2. In column (1) and (2), the authors use the pooled data, and the model is estimated by OLS. In column (3), the authors use the panel data and the model is estimated using a fixed-effect estimator.

- (a) (5 points) Interpret the coefficients for the years 0 to 20 reported in column (1). What can you conclude about the earnings profile of the immigrants?
- (b) (10 points) Focus only on the results reported in column (1) and (2). Why does the immigrant-native earnings gap in the first five years since arrival ($\hat{\beta}_1$) shrink?
- (c) (10 points) A young referee suggests that part of the reasons that explain different assimilation profiles could be permanent differences in earnings between immigrant women and other groups, i.e. discrimination against immigrant women. The referee therefore proposes to include in the model of column (3) an indicator for being a female migrant. Provide a brief comment to this proposal.

(d) (15 points) The abstract of the paper reads along these lines: "Prior cross-sectional work finds that immigrants initially held lower-paid occupations than natives but converged over time. In newly-assembled panel data, we show that, in fact, the average immigrant did not face a substantial earnings penalty upon first arrival and experienced earnings growth at the same rate as natives. Cross-sectional patterns are driven by biases from declining arrival cohort quality and departures of negatively-selected return migrants." Discuss whether the conclusion that immigrant did not face substantial earnings penalties upon arrival could be questioned. Next, discuss whether cross-sectional patterns could be explained by other reasons besides cohort quality. Remember to base your statements on the concepts learned in class.

Table 1: Age-earnings profile for natives and foreignborn, 1900-1920

| | POLS | POLS | FE |
|-------------------|-----------|----------|----------|
| | Earnings | Earnings | Earnings |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) |
| 0-5 Years in US | -1,255.73 | -384.48 | 139.68 |
| | (143.44) | (187.30 | (57.96) |
| 6-10 Years in US | -734.51 | -2.89 | 313.81 |
| | (147.44) | (172.05) | (113.61) |
| 11-20 Years in US | -352.93 | 173.83 | 175.55 |
| | (131.27) | (132.02) | (200.49) |
| 21-30 Years in US | -294.87 | 128.44 | -79.49 |
| | (142.10) | (138.93) | (150.33) |
| 30+ Years in US | 22.41 | 155.77 | 78.07 |
| | (184.65) | (178.49) | (186.55) |
| Arrive after 1890 | - | -739.18 | - |
| | - | (106.99) | - |
| Age controls | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| $	heta_t$ | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| α_j | Yes | Yes | - |
| N | 205,458 | 205,458 | 65,804 |

Source: selected and modified results from Table 4, Abramitzky et al. (2014), p. 484.

Earnings are measured in 2010 dollars. See text for explanation of the other variables and of the different samples.

Exercise 2 (40 points)

Romer (1993) proposes theoretical models of inflation that imply that more open countries should have lower inflation rates. His empirical analysis explains average annual inflation rates (since 1973) in terms of the average share of imports in gross domestic product since 1973—which is his measure of openness. While Romer does not specify both equations in a simultaneous system, he has in mind a two-equation system:

$$inf = \beta_{10} + \alpha_1 open + \beta_{11} lpcinc + \beta_{12} oil + u_1 \tag{1}$$

$$open = \beta_{20} + \alpha_2 inf + \beta_{21} lpcinc + \beta_{22} lland + u_2, \tag{2}$$

where inf measures the annual inflation rate, open measures imports as % of GDP, lpcinc is the log of 1980 per capita income measured in U.S. dollars, lland is the log of land area of the country measured in square miles and oil is a dummy variable that takes value of one if the country is an oil producer and zero otherwise.

The do-file of the analysis is reported on page 5 and the relative log-file starts on page 6.

- (a) (5 points) Consider first the analysis reported on line 17-21 of the do-file. Using a 5% significance level, test for heteroskedasticity.
- (b) (10 points) Discuss under which conditions the estimator reported on line 27 and 28 of the do-file can identify the parameters α_1 and α_2 . If needed, base your answer on appropriate tests.
- (c) (5 points) A commentator suggests to use *land* in levels, rather than in logs (*lland*), as an instrument for *open*. Provide at least two strategies based on which to decide which regressor to include.
- (d) (10 points) How would you test whether the OLS and IV estimates on the equation for *open* are statistically different?
- (e) (10 points) Explain whether you think the estimator used on line 27 of the do-file for inf is consistent and efficient.

Exercise 3 (20 points)

In their article "Do police reduce crime? Estimates using the allocation of police forces after a terrorist attack." published in the American Economic Review (2004), Di Tella and Schargrodsky wirte: "An important challenge in the crime literature is to isolate causal effects of police on crime. Following a terrorist attack on the main Jewish center in Buenos Aires, Argentina, in July 1994, all Jewish institutions received police protection. Thus, this hideous event induced a geographical allocation of police forces that can be presumed exogenous in a crime regression. Using data on the location of car thefts and police forces before and after the attack, we find a large deterrent effect of observable police on crime".

- (a) (10 points) Let $CarTheft_{it}$ indicate the number of car thefts in location i at time t, and $NewPolice_{it}$ the number of policemen allocated to location i at time t. Explain which model you think the authors are using to pin down the causal effect of police on crime.
- (b) (10 points) Interpret the coefficient(s) you have mentioned at point (a).

exam_s19.do - Printed on 5/6/2019 2:55:31 PM

```
**********
 1
 3
     * Exam Spring 2019: Question 2 Do-File
     **********
 5
7
     clear all
8
     cd "/Users/co/Documents/Teaching/Courses Taught/Econometrics/NTNU/Exam"
9
10
    log using exam s19, replace text
11
12
    use OPENNESS.DTA
13
14
15
16
17
    reg inf oil lpcinc lland
18
    predict res, res
19
    gen ressq= res*res
20
21
    reg ressq oil lpcinc lland
22
23
     ***
24
25
    reg inf oil lpcinc lland
    reg open oil lpcinc lland ivregress 2sls inf lpcinc oil (open = lland), robust ivregress 2sls open lpcinc land (inf = oil), robust
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
    log close
33
34
35
36
```

name: <unnamed>
log: C:\Users\costanzb\Documents\Teaching\Courses Taught\Econometrics\NTNU\Exam\exam_s19

log type: text

opened on: 6 May 2019, 14:57:10

1 . 2.

3 . use OPENNESS.DTA

4.

5. 6 . ***

7 . reg inf oil lpcinc lland

| Source | • | df | MS | Number of ob F(3, 110) | s = = | 114 2.04 |
|-------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|------------|----------------------------------------------|
| Model Residual | 3436.23107 61637.1906 | 3 110 | 1145.41036 560.338097 | Prob > F R-squared | = | 0.1119 0.0528 |
| Total | • | | 575.870989 | Adj R-square Root MSE | a = = | 23.671 |
| inf | • | | t 1 | ?> t [95% | Conf. | Interval] |
| _ | -6.690162 .6279128 2.549812 | 9.709693 2.084876 1.083075 21.49386 | -0.69 0.30 2.35 | 0.492 -25.9 0.764 -3.503 0.020 .4034 0.472 -58. | 823 102 | 12.55217 4.759648 4.696213 27.09257 |

- 8 . predict res, res
- 9 . gen ressq= res*res
- 11 . reg ressq oil lpcinc lland

| | SS | df | MS | Number of ob | s = = | 114 0.71 |
|-------|--------------------------|-----------|--------------------------|--------------|----------|-------------|
| Model | 23172800.5 1.2002e+09 | 3 | 7724266.82 10910513.4 | Prob > F | = | 0.5493 |
| | | | | Adj R-square | ed = | |
| | | | | | | |
| ressa | Coef. | Std. Err. | t | P> t [95% | Conf. | Intervall |

oil | -619.0514 1354.887 -0.46 0.649 -3304.119 2066.016 | 115.9505 290.9229 0.40 0.691 -460.5903 692.4913 | 1land | 208.7068 151.1319 1.38 0.170 -90.80121 508.2148 | cons | -2631.407 2999.245 -0.88 0.382 -8575.206 3312.392

12 . 13 . 14 . *** 15 . reg inf oil lpcinc lland

| | SS | df | MS | | per of obs | = | 114 2.04 |
|---------------|----------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----|----------------------------------------------|
| Model | | 110 | 1145.41036 | 6 Prok 7 R-sc |) > F quared R-squared | = | 0.1119 0.0528 |
| Total | 65073.4217 | | | _ | : MSE | = | |
| inf | Coef. | Std. Err. | t | P> t | [95% Coi | nf. | Interval] |
| lland | .6279128 2.549812 | | -0.69 0.30 2.35 -0.72 | 0.492 0.764 0.020 0.472 | | 3 | 12.55217 4.759648 4.696213 27.09257 |
| . reg open oi | l lpcinc llan | d | | | | | |

16

| Source | SS | df | MS | Number of obs | = | 114 |
|----------|------------|-----------|------------|---------------|-----|-----------|
| + | | | | F(3, 110) | = | 29.84 |
| Model | 28607.1395 | 3 | 9535.71318 | Prob > F | = | 0.0000 |
| Residual | 35150.8507 | 110 | 319.553188 | R-squared | = | 0.4487 |
| + | | | | Adj R-squared | = | 0.4336 |
| Total | 63757.9902 | 113 | 564.230002 | Root MSE | = | 17.876 |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| open | Coef. | Std. Err. | t | P> t [95% Co | nf. | Interval] |
| | | | | | | |

| open | Coef. | Std. Err. | t | P> t | [95% Conf. | Interval] |
|--------|----------|-----------|-------|-------|------------|-----------|
| oil | .5204514 | 7.332499 | 0.05 | 0.957 | -14.13235 | 14.93023 |
| lpcinc | | 1.574443 | 0.33 | 0.742 | -2.599724 | 3.640627 |
| lland | | .8179095 | -9.25 | 0.000 | -9.18777 | -5.945961 |
| cons | | 16.23158 | 7.22 | 0.000 | 85.08954 | 149.4239 |

17 . ivregress 2sls inf lpcinc oil (open = lland), robust

| Instrumental v | ariables (2SLS) | regression | Number of obs | = | 114 |
|----------------|-----------------|------------|---------------|---|--------|
| | | | Wald chi2(3) | = | 6.98 |
| | | | Prob > chi2 | = | 0.0725 |
| | | | R-squared | = | 0.0349 |
| | | | Root MSE | = | 23.471 |

| inf | | Robust Std. Err. | | P> z | [95% Conf. | Interval] |
|------|--------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| open | 3369707 .8032896 -6.555731 | .1500285 1.527911 3.708423 11.28069 | -2.25 0.53 -1.77 2.13 | 0.025 0.599 0.077 0.033 | 6310211 -2.19136 -13.82411 1.899121 | 0429202 3.797939 .7126437 46.11861 |

Instrumented: open
Instruments: lpcinc oil lland

18 . ivregress 2sls open lpcinc land (inf = oil), robust

| Instrumental | variables | (2SLS) | regression | Number of obs | = | 114 |
|--------------|-----------|--------|------------|---------------|---|--------|
| | | | | Wald chi2(3) | = | 17.30 |
| | | | | Prob > chi2 | = | 0.0006 |
| | | | | R-squared | = | |
| | | | | Root MSE | = | 23.952 |

| open | Coef. | Robust Std. Err. | z | P> z | [95% Conf. | Interval] |
|--------|----------|---------------------|-------|-------|------------|-----------|
| inf | .2660628 | 1.500991 | 0.18 | 0.859 | -2.675825 | 3.207951 |
| lpcinc | 4.160504 | 2.557307 | 1.63 | 0.104 | 8517257 | 9.172735 |
| land | 0000138 | 9.36e-06 | -1.47 | 0.141 | 0000321 | 4.57e-06 |
| _cons | 4.73574 | 39.00215 | 0.12 | 0.903 | -71.70707 | 81.17855 |

Instrumented: inf
Instruments: lpcinc land oil

19 . 20 .

21 .

22 . log close

name: <unnamed>
log: C:\Users\costanzb\Documents\Teaching\Courses Taught\Econometrics\NTNU\Exam\exam_s19

log type: text closed on: 6 May 2019, 14:57:10

APPENDIX



Statistical Tables

| TABLE | G.1 Cu | mulative | Areas und | er the Sta | ndard Noi | mal Distr | ibution | | | |
|--------------|--------|----------|-----------|------------|-----------|-----------|---------|--------|--------|--------|
| Z | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 |
| -3.0 | 0.0013 | 0.0013 | 0.0013 | 0.0012 | 0.0012 | 0.0011 | 0.0011 | 0.0011 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 |
| -2.9 | 0.0019 | 0.0018 | 0.0018 | 0.0017 | 0.0016 | 0.0016 | 0.0015 | 0.0015 | 0.0014 | 0.0014 |
| -2.8 | 0.0026 | 0.0025 | 0.0024 | 0.0023 | 0.0023 | 0.0022 | 0.0021 | 0.0021 | 0.0020 | 0.0019 |
| -2.7 | 0.0035 | 0.0034 | 0.0033 | 0.0032 | 0.0031 | 0.0030 | 0.0029 | 0.0028 | 0.0027 | 0.0026 |
| -2.6 | 0.0047 | 0.0045 | 0.0044 | 0.0043 | 0.0041 | 0.0040 | 0.0039 | 0.0038 | 0.0037 | 0.0036 |
| -2.5 | 0.0062 | 0.0060 | 0.0059 | 0.0057 | 0.0055 | 0.0054 | 0.0052 | 0.0051 | 0.0049 | 0.0048 |
| -2.4 | 0.0082 | 0.0080 | 0.0078 | 0.0075 | 0.0073 | 0.0071 | 0.0069 | 0.0068 | 0.0066 | 0.0064 |
| -2.3 | 0.0107 | 0.0104 | 0.0102 | 0.0099 | 0.0096 | 0.0094 | 0.0091 | 0.0089 | 0.0087 | 0.0084 |
| -2.2 | 0.0139 | 0.0136 | 0.0132 | 0.0129 | 0.0125 | 0.0122 | 0.0119 | 0.0116 | 0.0113 | 0.0110 |
| -2.1 | 0.0179 | 0.0174 | 0.0170 | 0.0166 | 0.0162 | 0.0158 | 0.0154 | 0.0150 | 0.0146 | 0.0143 |
| -2.0 | 0.0228 | 0.0222 | 0.0217 | 0.0212 | 0.0207 | 0.0202 | 0.0197 | 0.0192 | 0.0188 | 0.0183 |
| -1.9 | 0.0287 | 0.0281 | 0.0274 | 0.0268 | 0.0262 | 0.0256 | 0.0250 | 0.0244 | 0.0239 | 0.0233 |
| - 1.8 | 0.0359 | 0.0351 | 0.0344 | 0.0336 | 0.0329 | 0.0322 | 0.0314 | 0.0307 | 0.0301 | 0.0294 |
| -1.7 | 0.0446 | 0.0436 | 0.0427 | 0.0418 | 0.0409 | 0.0401 | 0.0392 | 0.0384 | 0.0375 | 0.0367 |
| -1.6 | 0.0548 | 0.0537 | 0.0526 | 0.0516 | 0.0505 | 0.0495 | 0.0485 | 0.0475 | 0.0465 | 0.0455 |
| -1.5 | 0.0668 | 0.0655 | 0.0643 | 0.0630 | 0.0618 | 0.0606 | 0.0594 | 0.0582 | 0.0571 | 0.0559 |
| -1.4 | 0.0808 | 0.0793 | 0.0778 | 0.0764 | 0.0749 | 0.0735 | 0.0721 | 0.0708 | 0.0694 | 0.0681 |
| -1.3 | 0.0968 | 0.0951 | 0.0934 | 0.0918 | 0.0901 | 0.0885 | 0.0869 | 0.0853 | 0.0838 | 0.0823 |
| -1.2 | 0.1151 | 0.1131 | 0.1112 | 0.1093 | 0.1075 | 0.1056 | 0.1038 | 0.1020 | 0.1003 | 0.0985 |
| -1.1 | 0.1357 | 0.1335 | 0.1314 | 0.1292 | 0.1271 | 0.1251 | 0.1230 | 0.1210 | 0.1190 | 0.1170 |
| -1.0 | 0.1587 | 0.1562 | 0.1539 | 0.1515 | 0.1492 | 0.1469 | 0.1446 | 0.1423 | 0.1401 | 0.1379 |
| -0.9 | 0.1841 | 0.1814 | 0.1788 | 0.1762 | 0.1736 | 0.1711 | 0.1685 | 0.1660 | 0.1635 | 0.1611 |
| -0.8 | 0.2119 | 0.2090 | 0.2061 | 0.2033 | 0.2005 | 0.1977 | 0.1949 | 0.1922 | 0.1894 | 0.1867 |
| -0.7 | 0.2420 | 0.2389 | 0.2358 | 0.2327 | 0.2296 | 0.2266 | 0.2236 | 0.2206 | 0.2177 | 0.2148 |
| -0.6 | 0.2743 | 0.2709 | 0.2676 | 0.2643 | 0.2611 | 0.2578 | 0.2546 | 0.2514 | 0.2483 | 0.2451 |
| -0.5 | 0.3085 | 0.3050 | 0.3015 | 0.2981 | 0.2946 | 0.2912 | 0.2877 | 0.2843 | 0.2810 | 0.2776 |

(continued)

831

| TABLE | G.1 (C | ontinued) | | | | | | | | |
|------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| Z | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 |
| -0.4 | 0.3446 | 0.3409 | 0.3372 | 0.3336 | 0.3300 | 0.3264 | 0.3228 | 0.3192 | 0.3156 | 0.3121 |
| -0.3 | 0.3821 | 0.3783 | 0.3745 | 0.3707 | 0.3669 | 0.3632 | 0.3594 | 0.3557 | 0.3520 | 0.3483 |
| -0.2 | 0.4207 | 0.4168 | 0.4129 | 0.4090 | 0.4052 | 0.4013 | 0.3974 | 0.3936 | 0.3897 | 0.3859 |
| -0.1 | 0.4602 | 0.4562 | 0.4522 | 0.4483 | 0.4443 | 0.4404 | 0.4364 | 0.4325 | 0.4286 | 0.4247 |
| -0.0 | 0.5000 | 0.4960 | 0.4920 | 0.4880 | 0.4840 | 0.4801 | 0.4761 | 0.4721 | 0.4681 | 0.4641 |
| 0.0 | 0.5000 | 0.5040 | 0.5080 | 0.5120 | 0.5160 | 0.5199 | 0.5239 | 0.5279 | 0.5319 | 0.5359 |
| 0.1 | 0.5398 | 0.5438 | 0.5478 | 0.5517 | 0.5557 | 0.5596 | 0.5636 | 0.5675 | 0.5714 | 0.5753 |
| 0.2 | 0.5793 | 0.5832 | 0.5871 | 0.5910 | 0.5948 | 0.5987 | 0.6026 | 0.6064 | 0.6103 | 0.6141 |
| 0.3 | 0.6179 | 0.6217 | 0.6255 | 0.6293 | 0.6331 | 0.6368 | 0.6406 | 0.6443 | 0.6480 | 0.6517 |
| 0.4 | 0.6554 | 0.6591 | 0.6628 | 0.6664 | 0.6700 | 0.6736 | 0.6772 | 0.6808 | 0.6844 | 0.6879 |
| 0.5 | 0.6915 | 0.6950 | 0.6985 | 0.7019 | 0.7054 | 0.7088 | 0.7123 | 0.7157 | 0.7190 | 0.7224 |
| 0.6 | 0.7257 | 0.7291 | 0.7324 | 0.7357 | 0.7389 | 0.7422 | 0.7454 | 0.7486 | 0.7517 | 0.7549 |
| 0.7 | 0.7580 | 0.7611 | 0.7642 | 0.7673 | 0.7704 | 0.7734 | 0.7764 | 0.7794 | 0.7823 | 0.7852 |
| 0.8 | 0.7881 | 0.7910 | 0.7939 | 0.7967 | 0.7995 | 0.8023 | 0.8051 | 0.8078 | 0.8106 | 0.8133 |
| 0.9 | 0.8159 | 0.8186 | 0.8212 | 0.8238 | 0.8264 | 0.8289 | 0.8315 | 0.8340 | 0.8365 | 0.8389 |
| 1.0 | 0.8413 | 0.8438 | 0.8461 | 0.8485 | 0.8508 | 0.8531 | 0.8554 | 0.8577 | 0.8599 | 0.8621 |
| 1.1 | 0.8643 | 0.8665 | 0.8686 | 0.8708 | 0.8729 | 0.8749 | 0.8770 | 0.8790 | 0.8810 | 0.8830 |
| 1.2 | 0.8849 | 0.8869 | 0.8888 | 0.8907 | 0.8925 | 0.8944 | 0.8962 | 0.8980 | 0.8997 | 0.9015 |
| 1.3 | 0.9032 | 0.9049 | 0.9066 | 0.9082 | 0.9099 | 0.9115 | 0.9131 | 0.9147 | 0.9162 | 0.9177 |
| 1.4 | 0.9192 | 0.9207 | 0.9222 | 0.9236 | 0.9251 | 0.9265 | 0.9279 | 0.9292 | 0.9306 | 0.9319 |
| 1.5 | 0.9332 | 0.9345 | 0.9357 | 0.9370 | 0.9382 | 0.9394 | 0.9406 | 0.9418 | 0.9429 | 0.9441 |
| 1.6 | 0.9452 | 0.9463 | 0.9474 | 0.9484 | 0.9495 | 0.9505 | 0.9515 | 0.9525 | 0.9535 | 0.9545 |
| 1.7 | 0.9554 | 0.9564 | 0.9573 | 0.9582 | 0.9591 | 0.9599 | 0.9608 | 0.9616 | 0.9625 | 0.9633 |
| 1.8 | 0.9641 | 0.9649 | 0.9656 | 0.9664 | 0.9671 | 0.9678 | 0.9686 | 0.9693 | 0.9699 | 0.9706 |
| 1.9 | 0.9713 | 0.9719 | 0.9726 | 0.9732 | 0.9738 | 0.9744 | 0.9750 | 0.9756 | 0.9761 | 0.9767 |
| 2.0 | 0.9772 | 0.9778 | 0.9783 | 0.9788 | 0.9793 | 0.9798 | 0.9803 | 0.9808 | 0.9812 | 0.9817 |
| 2.1 | 0.9821 | 0.9826 | 0.9830 | 0.9834 | 0.9838 | 0.9842 | 0.9846 | 0.9850 | 0.9854 | 0.9857 |
| 2.2 | 0.9861 | 0.9864 | 0.9868 | 0.9871 | 0.9875 | 0.9878 | 0.9881 | 0.9884 | 0.9887 | 0.9890 |
| 2.3 | 0.9893 | 0.9896 | 0.9898 | 0.9901 | 0.9904 | 0.9906 | 0.9909 | 0.9911 | 0.9913 | 0.9916 |
| 2.4 | 0.9918 | 0.9920 | 0.9922 | 0.9925 | 0.9927 | 0.9929 | 0.9931 | 0.9932 | 0.9934 | 0.9936 |
| 2.5 | 0.9938 | 0.9940 | 0.9941 | 0.9943 | 0.9945 | 0.9946 | 0.9948 | 0.9949 | 0.9951 | 0.9952 |
| 2.6 | 0.9953 | 0.9955 | 0.9956 | 0.9957 | 0.9959 | 0.9960 | 0.9961 | 0.9962 | 0.9963 | 0.9964 |
| 2.7 | 0.9965 | 0.9966 | 0.9967 | 0.9968 | 0.9969 | 0.9970 | 0.9971 | 0.9972 | 0.9973 | 0.9974 |
| 2.8 | 0.9974 | 0.9975 | 0.9976 | 0.9977 | 0.9977 | 0.9978 | 0.9979 | 0.9979 | 0.9980 | 0.9981 0.9986 |
| 2.9 3.0 | 0.9981 0.9987 | 0.9982 0.9987 | 0.9982 0.9987 | 0.9983 0.9988 | 0.9984 0.9988 | 0.9984 0.9989 | 0.9985 0.9989 | 0.9985 0.9989 | 0.9986 0.9990 | 0.9986 |

Examples: If $Z \sim \text{Normal}(0,1)$, then $P(Z \le -1.32) = .0934$ and $P(Z \le 1.84) = .9671$.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function normprob.

| | | | | Significance Level | | |
|---------|----------|-------|-------|--------------------|--------|--------|
| 1-Taile | ed: | .10 | .05 | .025 | .01 | .005 |
| 2-Taile | ed: | .20 | .10 | .05 | .02 | .01 |
| | 1 | 3.078 | 6.314 | 12.706 | 31.821 | 63.657 |
| | 2 | 1.886 | 2.920 | 4.303 | 6.965 | 9.925 |
| | 3 | 1.638 | 2.353 | 3.182 | 4.541 | 5.841 |
| | 4 | 1.533 | 2.132 | 2.776 | 3.747 | 4.604 |
| | 5 | 1.476 | 2.015 | 2.571 | 3.365 | 4.032 |
| | 6 | 1.440 | 1.943 | 2.447 | 3.143 | 3.707 |
| | 7 | 1.415 | 1.895 | 2.365 | 2.998 | 3.499 |
| | 8 | 1.397 | 1.860 | 2.306 | 2.896 | 3.355 |
| | 9 | 1.383 | 1.833 | 2.262 | 2.821 | 3.250 |
| D | 10 | 1.372 | 1.812 | 2.228 | 2.764 | 3.169 |
| e | 11 | 1.363 | 1.796 | 2.201 | 2.718 | 3.106 |
| g | 12 | 1.356 | 1.782 | 2.179 | 2.681 | 3.055 |
| r | 13 | 1.350 | 1.771 | 2.160 | 2.650 | 3.012 |
| e | 14 | 1.345 | 1.761 | 2.145 | 2.624 | 2.977 |
| е | 15 | 1.341 | 1.753 | 2.131 | 2.602 | 2.947 |
| S | 16 | 1.337 | 1.746 | 2.120 | 2.583 | 2.921 |
| 0 | 17 | 1.333 | 1.740 | 2.110 | 2.567 | 2.898 |
| f | 18 | 1.330 | 1.734 | 2.101 | 2.552 | 2.878 |
| | 19 | 1.328 | 1.729 | 2.093 | 2.539 | 2.861 |
| F | 20 | 1.325 | 1.725 | 2.086 | 2.528 | 2.845 |
| r | 21 | 1.323 | 1.721 | 2.080 | 2.518 | 2.831 |
| e e | 22 | 1.321 | 1.717 | 2.074 | 2.508 | 2.819 |
| d | 23 | 1.319 | 1.714 | 2.069 | 2.500 | 2.807 |
| 0 | 24 | 1.318 | 1.711 | 2.064 | 2.492 | 2.797 |
| m | 25 | 1.316 | 1.708 | 2.060 | 2.485 | 2.787 |
| | 26 | 1.315 | 1.706 | 2.056 | 2.479 | 2.779 |
| | 27 | 1.314 | 1.703 | 2.052 | 2.473 | 2.771 |
| | 28 | 1.313 | 1.701 | 2.048 | 2.467 | 2.763 |
| | 29 | 1.311 | 1.699 | 2.045 | 2.462 | 2.756 |
| | 30 | 1.310 | 1.697 | 2.042 | 2.457 | 2.750 |
| | 40 | 1.303 | 1.684 | 2.021 | 2.423 | 2.704 |
| | 60 | 1.296 | 1.671 | 2.000 | 2.390 | 2.660 |
| | 90 | 1.291 | 1.662 | 1.987 | 2.368 | 2.632 |
| | 120 | 1.289 | 1.658 | 1.980 | 2.358 | 2.617 |
| | ∞ | 1.282 | 1.645 | 1.960 | 2.326 | 2.576 |

Examples: The 1% critical value for a one-tailed test with 25 df is 2.485. The 5% critical value for a two-tailed test with large (> 120) df is 1.96.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function invttail.

| TABL | E G.3a | 10% Critical Values of the F Distribution | | | | | | | | | |
|--------|----------|-------------------------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| | | Numerator Degrees of Freedom | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| | 10 | 3.29 | 2.92 | 2.73 | 2.61 | 2.52 | 2.46 | 2.41 | 2.38 | 2.35 | 2.32 |
| | 11 | 3.23 | 2.86 | 2.66 | 2.54 | 2.45 | 2.39 | 2.34 | 2.30 | 2.27 | 2.25 |
| D e | 12 | 3.18 | 2.81 | 2.61 | 2.48 | 2.39 | 2.33 | 2.28 | 2.24 | 2.21 | 2.19 |
| n | 13 | 3.14 | 2.76 | 2.56 | 2.43 | 2.35 | 2.28 | 2.23 | 2.20 | 2.16 | 2.14 |
| 0 m | 14 | 3.10 | 2.73 | 2.52 | 2.39 | 2.31 | 2.24 | 2.19 | 2.15 | 2.12 | 2.10 |
| m i | 15 | 3.07 | 2.70 | 2.49 | 2.36 | 2.27 | 2.21 | 2.16 | 2.12 | 2.09 | 2.06 |
| n | 16 | 3.05 | 2.67 | 2.46 | 2.33 | 2.24 | 2.18 | 2.13 | 2.09 | 2.06 | 2.03 |
| a t | 17 | 3.03 | 2.64 | 2.44 | 2.31 | 2.22 | 2.15 | 2.10 | 2.06 | 2.03 | 2.00 |
| 0 | 18 | 3.01 | 2.62 | 2.42 | 2.29 | 2.20 | 2.13 | 2.08 | 2.04 | 2.00 | 1.98 |
| r | 19 | 2.99 | 2.61 | 2.40 | 2.27 | 2.18 | 2.11 | 2.06 | 2.02 | 1.98 | 1.96 |
| D | 20 | 2.97 | 2.59 | 2.38 | 2.25 | 2.16 | 2.09 | 2.04 | 2.00 | 1.96 | 1.94 |
| e g | 21 | 2.96 | 2.57 | 2.36 | 2.23 | 2.14 | 2.08 | 2.02 | 1.98 | 1.95 | 1.92 |
| r | 22 | 2.95 | 2.56 | 2.35 | 2.22 | 2.13 | 2.06 | 2.01 | 1.97 | 1.93 | 1.90 |
| e e | 23 | 2.94 | 2.55 | 2.34 | 2.21 | 2.11 | 2.05 | 1.99 | 1.95 | 1.92 | 1.89 |
| s | 24 | 2.93 | 2.54 | 2.33 | 2.19 | 2.10 | 2.04 | 1.98 | 1.94 | 1.91 | 1.88 |
| 0 | 25 | 2.92 | 2.53 | 2.32 | 2.18 | 2.09 | 2.02 | 1.97 | 1.93 | 1.89 | 1.87 |
| o f | 26 | 2.91 | 2.52 | 2.31 | 2.17 | 2.08 | 2.01 | 1.96 | 1.92 | 1.88 | 1.86 |
| TC. | 27 | 2.90 | 2.51 | 2.30 | 2.17 | 2.07 | 2.00 | 1.95 | 1.91 | 1.87 | 1.85 |
| F r | 28 | 2.89 | 2.50 | 2.29 | 2.16 | 2.06 | 2.00 | 1.94 | 1.90 | 1.87 | 1.84 |
| e | 29 | 2.89 | 2.50 | 2.28 | 2.15 | 2.06 | 1.99 | 1.93 | 1.89 | 1.86 | 1.83 |
| e d | 30 | 2.88 | 2.49 | 2.28 | 2.14 | 2.05 | 1.98 | 1.93 | 1.88 | 1.85 | 1.82 |
| 0 | 40 | 2.84 | 2.44 | 2.23 | 2.09 | 2.00 | 1.93 | 1.87 | 1.83 | 1.79 | 1.76 |
| m | 60 | 2.79 | 2.39 | 2.18 | 2.04 | 1.95 | 1.87 | 1.82 | 1.77 | 1.74 | 1.71 |
| | 90 | 2.76 | 2.36 | 2.15 | 2.01 | 1.91 | 1.84 | 1.78 | 1.74 | 1.70 | 1.67 |
| | 120 | 2.75 | 2.35 | 2.13 | 1.99 | 1.90 | 1.82 | 1.77 | 1.72 | 1.68 | 1.65 |
| | ∞ | 2.71 | 2.30 | 2.08 | 1.94 | 1.85 | 1.77 | 1.72 | 1.67 | 1.63 | 1.60 |

Example: The 10% critical value for numerator df = 2 and denominator df = 40 is 2.44.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function invFtail.

| TAB | LE G.3b | 5% Cri | itical Valu | ies of the | F Distrib | ution | | | | | |
|--------|----------|------------------------------|-------------|------------|-----------|-------|------|------|------|------|------|
| | | Numerator Degrees of Freedom | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| | 10 | 4.96 | 4.10 | 3.71 | 3.48 | 3.33 | 3.22 | 3.14 | 3.07 | 3.02 | 2.98 |
| | 11 | 4.84 | 3.98 | 3.59 | 3.36 | 3.20 | 3.09 | 3.01 | 2.95 | 2.90 | 2.85 |
| D | 12 | 4.75 | 3.89 | 3.49 | 3.26 | 3.11 | 3.00 | 2.91 | 2.85 | 2.80 | 2.75 |
| e n | 13 | 4.67 | 3.81 | 3.41 | 3.18 | 3.03 | 2.92 | 2.83 | 2.77 | 2.71 | 2.67 |
| 0 | 14 | 4.60 | 3.74 | 3.34 | 3.11 | 2.96 | 2.85 | 2.76 | 2.70 | 2.65 | 2.60 |
| m i | 15 | 4.54 | 3.68 | 3.29 | 3.06 | 2.90 | 2.79 | 2.71 | 2.64 | 2.59 | 2.54 |
| n | 16 | 4.49 | 3.63 | 3.24 | 3.01 | 2.85 | 2.74 | 2.66 | 2.59 | 2.54 | 2.49 |
| a t | 17 | 4.45 | 3.59 | 3.20 | 2.96 | 2.81 | 2.70 | 2.61 | 2.55 | 2.49 | 2.45 |
| o | 18 | 4.41 | 3.55 | 3.16 | 2.93 | 2.77 | 2.66 | 2.58 | 2.51 | 2.46 | 2.41 |
| r | 19 | 4.38 | 3.52 | 3.13 | 2.90 | 2.74 | 2.63 | 2.54 | 2.48 | 2.42 | 2.38 |
| D | 20 | 4.35 | 3.49 | 3.10 | 2.87 | 2.71 | 2.60 | 2.51 | 2.45 | 2.39 | 2.35 |
| e | 21 | 4.32 | 3.47 | 3.07 | 2.84 | 2.68 | 2.57 | 2.49 | 2.42 | 2.37 | 2.32 |
| g r | 22 | 4.30 | 3.44 | 3.05 | 2.82 | 2.66 | 2.55 | 2.46 | 2.40 | 2.34 | 2.30 |
| e | 23 | 4.28 | 3.42 | 3.03 | 2.80 | 2.64 | 2.53 | 2.44 | 2.37 | 2.32 | 2.27 |
| e s | 24 | 4.26 | 3.40 | 3.01 | 2.78 | 2.62 | 2.51 | 2.42 | 2.36 | 2.30 | 2.25 |
| | 25 | 4.24 | 3.39 | 2.99 | 2.76 | 2.60 | 2.49 | 2.40 | 2.34 | 2.28 | 2.24 |
| o f | 26 | 4.23 | 3.37 | 2.98 | 2.74 | 2.59 | 2.47 | 2.39 | 2.32 | 2.27 | 2.22 |
| Е | 27 | 4.21 | 3.35 | 2.96 | 2.73 | 2.57 | 2.46 | 2.37 | 2.31 | 2.25 | 2.20 |
| F r | 28 | 4.20 | 3.34 | 2.95 | 2.71 | 2.56 | 2.45 | 2.36 | 2.29 | 2.24 | 2.19 |
| e | 29 | 4.18 | 3.33 | 2.93 | 2.70 | 2.55 | 2.43 | 2.35 | 2.28 | 2.22 | 2.18 |
| e d | 30 | 4.17 | 3.32 | 2.92 | 2.69 | 2.53 | 2.42 | 2.33 | 2.27 | 2.21 | 2.16 |
| 0 | 40 | 4.08 | 3.23 | 2.84 | 2.61 | 2.45 | 2.34 | 2.25 | 2.18 | 2.12 | 2.08 |
| m | 60 | 4.00 | 3.15 | 2.76 | 2.53 | 2.37 | 2.25 | 2.17 | 2.10 | 2.04 | 1.99 |
| | 90 | 3.95 | 3.10 | 2.71 | 2.47 | 2.32 | 2.20 | 2.11 | 2.04 | 1.99 | 1.94 |
| | 120 | 3.92 | 3.07 | 2.68 | 2.45 | 2.29 | 2.17 | 2.09 | 2.02 | 1.96 | 1.91 |
| | ∞ | 3.84 | 3.00 | 2.60 | 2.37 | 2.21 | 2.10 | 2.01 | 1.94 | 1.88 | 1.83 |

Example: The 5% critical value for numerator df = 4 and large denominator $df (\infty)$ is 2.37.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function invFtail.

| TAB | LE G.3c | .3c 1% Critical Values of the F Distribution | | | | | | | | | |
|--------|----------|----------------------------------------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| | | Numerator Degrees of Freedom | | | | | | | | | |
| | | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| | 10 | 10.04 | 7.56 | 6.55 | 5.99 | 5.64 | 5.39 | 5.20 | 5.06 | 4.94 | 4.85 |
| | 11 | 9.65 | 7.21 | 6.22 | 5.67 | 5.32 | 5.07 | 4.89 | 4.74 | 4.63 | 4.54 |
| D | 12 | 9.33 | 6.93 | 5.95 | 5.41 | 5.06 | 4.82 | 4.64 | 4.50 | 4.39 | 4.30 |
| e n | 13 | 9.07 | 6.70 | 5.74 | 5.21 | 4.86 | 4.62 | 4.44 | 4.30 | 4.19 | 4.10 |
| 0 | 14 | 8.86 | 6.51 | 5.56 | 5.04 | 4.69 | 4.46 | 4.28 | 4.14 | 4.03 | 3.94 |
| m i | 15 | 8.68 | 6.36 | 5.42 | 4.89 | 4.56 | 4.32 | 4.14 | 4.00 | 3.89 | 3.80 |
| n | 16 | 8.53 | 6.23 | 5.29 | 4.77 | 4.44 | 4.20 | 4.03 | 3.89 | 3.78 | 3.69 |
| a t | 17 | 8.40 | 6.11 | 5.18 | 4.67 | 4.34 | 4.10 | 3.93 | 3.79 | 3.68 | 3.59 |
| 0 | 18 | 8.29 | 6.01 | 5.09 | 4.58 | 4.25 | 4.01 | 3.84 | 3.71 | 3.60 | 3.51 |
| r | 19 | 8.18 | 5.93 | 5.01 | 4.50 | 4.17 | 3.94 | 3.77 | 3.63 | 3.52 | 3.43 |
| D | 20 | 8.10 | 5.85 | 4.94 | 4.43 | 4.10 | 3.87 | 3.70 | 3.56 | 3.46 | 3.37 |
| e | 21 | 8.02 | 5.78 | 4.87 | 4.37 | 4.04 | 3.81 | 3.64 | 3.51 | 3.40 | 3.31 |
| g r | 22 | 7.95 | 5.72 | 4.82 | 4.31 | 3.99 | 3.76 | 3.59 | 3.45 | 3.35 | 3.26 |
| e | 23 | 7.88 | 5.66 | 4.76 | 4.26 | 3.94 | 3.71 | 3.54 | 3.41 | 3.30 | 3.21 |
| e s | 24 | 7.82 | 5.61 | 4.72 | 4.22 | 3.90 | 3.67 | 3.50 | 3.36 | 3.26 | 3.17 |
| _ | 25 | 7.77 | 5.57 | 4.68 | 4.18 | 3.85 | 3.63 | 3.46 | 3.32 | 3.22 | 3.13 |
| o f | 26 | 7.72 | 5.53 | 4.64 | 4.14 | 3.82 | 3.59 | 3.42 | 3.29 | 3.18 | 3.09 |
| | 27 | 7.68 | 5.49 | 4.60 | 4.11 | 3.78 | 3.56 | 3.39 | 3.26 | 3.15 | 3.06 |
| F r | 28 | 7.64 | 5.45 | 4.57 | 4.07 | 3.75 | 3.53 | 3.36 | 3.23 | 3.12 | 3.03 |
| e | 29 | 7.60 | 5.42 | 4.54 | 4.04 | 3.73 | 3.50 | 3.33 | 3.20 | 3.09 | 3.00 |
| e d | 30 | 7.56 | 5.39 | 4.51 | 4.02 | 3.70 | 3.47 | 3.30 | 3.17 | 3.07 | 2.98 |
| 0 | 40 | 7.31 | 5.18 | 4.31 | 3.83 | 3.51 | 3.29 | 3.12 | 2.99 | 2.89 | 2.80 |
| m | 60 | 7.08 | 4.98 | 4.13 | 3.65 | 3.34 | 3.12 | 2.95 | 2.82 | 2.72 | 2.63 |
| | 90 | 6.93 | 4.85 | 4.01 | 3.54 | 3.23 | 3.01 | 2.84 | 2.72 | 2.61 | 2.52 |
| | 120 | 6.85 | 4.79 | 3.95 | 3.48 | 3.17 | 2.96 | 2.79 | 2.66 | 2.56 | 2.47 |
| | ∞ | 6.63 | 4.61 | 3.78 | 3.32 | 3.02 | 2.80 | 2.64 | 2.51 | 2.41 | 2.32 |

Example: The 1% critical value for numerator df = 3 and denominator df = 60 is 4.13.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function invFtail.

| TABI | E G.4 | Critical Values of | the Chi-Square Di | stribution |
|--------------|-------|---------------------------|-------------------|------------|
| | | | Significance Leve | el |
| | | .10 | .05 | .01 |
| | 1 | 2.71 | 3.84 | 6.63 |
| | 2 | 4.61 | 5.99 | 9.21 |
| | 3 | 6.25 | 7.81 | 11.34 |
| | 4 | 7.78 | 9.49 | 13.28 |
| | 5 | 9.24 | 11.07 | 15.09 |
| | 6 | 10.64 | 12.59 | 16.81 |
| | 7 | 12.02 | 14.07 | 18.48 |
| | 8 | 13.36 | 15.51 | 20.09 |
| D | 9 | 14.68 | 16.92 | 21.67 |
| e | 10 | 15.99 | 18.31 | 23.21 |
| g | 11 | 17.28 | 19.68 | 24.72 |
| r e | 12 | 18.55 | 21.03 | 26.22 |
| e | 13 | 19.81 | 22.36 | 27.69 |
| S | 14 | 21.06 | 23.68 | 29.14 |
| 0 | 15 | 22.31 | 25.00 | 30.58 |
| f | 16 | 23.54 | 26.30 | 32.00 |
| \mathbf{F} | 17 | 24.77 | 27.59 | 33.41 |
| r e | 18 | 25.99 | 28.87 | 34.81 |
| e | 19 | 27.20 | 30.14 | 36.19 |
| d | 20 | 28.41 | 31.41 | 37.57 |
| o m | 21 | 29.62 | 32.67 | 38.93 |
| | 22 | 30.81 | 33.92 | 40.29 |
| | 23 | 32.01 | 35.17 | 41.64 |
| | 24 | 33.20 | 36.42 | 42.98 |
| | 25 | 34.38 | 37.65 | 44.31 |
| | 26 | 35.56 | 38.89 | 45.64 |
| | 27 | 36.74 | 40.11 | 46.96 |
| | 28 | 37.92 | 41.34 | 48.28 |
| | 29 | 39.09 | 42.56 | 49.59 |
| | 30 | 40.26 | 43.77 | 50.89 |

Example: The 5% critical value with df = 8 is 15.51.

Source: This table was generated using the Stata® function invchi2tail.